

CR-05 - Goals and Outcomes

Progress the jurisdiction has made in carrying out its strategic plan and its action plan. 91.520(a)

This could be an overview that includes major initiatives and highlights that were proposed and executed throughout the program year.

The city of Muskegon's programs were not interrupted because of COVID-19. The projects funded had great success and many households were served.

Comparison of the proposed versus actual outcomes for each outcome measure submitted with the consolidated plan and explain, if applicable, why progress was not made toward meeting goals and objectives. 91.520(g)

Categories, priority levels, funding sources and amounts, outcomes/objectives, goal outcome indicators, units of measure, targets, actual outcomes/outputs, and percentage completed for each of the grantee's program year goals.

Goal	Category	Source / Amount	Indicator	Unit of Measure	Expected – Strategic Plan	Actual – Strategic Plan	Percent Complete	Expected – Program Year	Actual – Program Year	Percent Complete
Acquisition Development Resale	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Homeowner Housing Added	Household Housing Unit	10	0	0.00%			
Code Enforcement - Inspections	Non-Housing Community Development Housing Rehab	CDBG: \$	Housing Code Enforcement/Foreclosed Property Care	Household Housing Unit	275	0	0.00%			
Code Enforcement - Neighborhood Clean-Up	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	10	0	0.00%			

Code Enforcement - Smoke and CO Detectors	Code Enforcement, Neighborhood Safety, Public Service	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	250	0	0.00%			
Demolition	Non-Housing Community Development Blight Fight	CDBG: \$	Buildings Demolished	Buildings	35	0	0.00%	5	0	0.00%
Demolition	Non-Housing Community Development Blight Fight	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	0	0		15	0	0.00%
Exterior Paint/Siding Housing	Neighborhood Stabilization, Enhancement, Code Enforcement, Preserving of Existing Housing Stock	CDBG: \$	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities for Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Households Assisted	55	5	9.09%			
Exterior Paint/Siding Housing	Neighborhood Stabilization, Enhancement, Code Enforcement, Preserving of Existing Housing Stock	CDBG: \$	Homeowner Housing Rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	0	0		4	5	125.00%

Exterior Paint/Siding Housing	Neighborhood Stabilization, Enhancement, Code Enforcement, Preserving of Existing Housing Stock	CDBG: \$	Jobs created/retained	Jobs	5	0	0.00%			
Fair Housing	Non-Housing Community Development Fair Housing Activities	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	25	0	0.00%			
Home Repairs	Home Repairs	CDBG: \$	Homeowner Housing Rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	500	0	0.00%	24	34	141.67%
Homebuyer Assistance/Education	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Homeowner Housing Added	Household Housing Unit	15	0	0.00%			
Housing	Affordable Housing	HOME: \$	Homeowner Housing Added	Household Housing Unit	5	0	0.00%	3	2	66.67%
Housing	Affordable Housing	HOME: \$	Jobs created/retained	Jobs	5	0	0.00%			
Improved Neighborhoods	Non-Housing Community Development Economic Development	CDBG: \$	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	0	0		5	0	0.00%

Improved Neighborhoods	Non-Housing Community Development Economic Development	CDBG: \$	Jobs created/retained	Jobs	5	0	0.00%			
Improved Neighborhoods	Non-Housing Community Development Economic Development	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	3	0	0.00%			
Legal Services	Education, Outreach, Public Service	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	10	0	0.00%			
Match Funding	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Businesses assisted	Businesses Assisted	0	0		5	0	0.00%
Match Funding	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	10	0	0.00%			
Neighborhood Policing	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	25	0	0.00%			
Owner Occupied Rehabilitation	Home Repairs	CDBG: \$	Homeowner Housing Rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	350	0	0.00%			
Public Facilities Improvement	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	3	0	0.00%	500	0	0.00%

Public Service Opportunities	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	0	0		200	250	125.00%
Public Service Opportunities	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	50	0	0.00%			
Public Service Opportunities	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Homeowner Housing Rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	10	0	0.00%			
Rental Rehabilitation Program	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$20000	Rental units rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	15	0	0.00%	4	0	0.00%
Senior Assistance	Non-Homeless Special Needs	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	375	0	0.00%			
Streets	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	500	0	0.00%			
Youth Opportunities	Non-Housing Community Development Youth Experiences	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	2500	0	0.00%	200	25	12.50%

Youth Opportunities	Non-Housing Community Development Youth Experiences	CDBG: \$	Jobs created/retained	Jobs	4	0	0.00%	5	0	0.00%
---------------------	---	-------------	-----------------------	------	---	---	-------	---	---	-------

Table 1 - Accomplishments – Program Year & Strategic Plan to Date

Assess how the jurisdiction’s use of funds, particularly CDBG, addresses the priorities and specific objectives identified in the plan, giving special attention to the highest priority activities identified.

Our CDBG programs addressed priorities of safe housing, youth development and public facilities and services. The plan for the 5 years of accomplishments is in it's 4th year so collectively we will add to our table the actuals to date. Some of our programs are no longer- Code Enforcement and Demolitions. Other programming is offered periodically - streets and sidewalks, however some other programs are under-utilized like our rental rehabilitation program.

CR-10 - Racial and Ethnic composition of families assisted

Describe the families assisted (including the racial and ethnic status of families assisted).

91.520(a)

	CDBG	HOME
White	16	1
Black or African American	22	1
Asian	0	0
American Indian or American Native	0	0
Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander	0	0
Total	38	2
Hispanic	0	0
Not Hispanic	0	68

Table 2 – Table of assistance to racial and ethnic populations by source of funds

Narrative

The families assisted show that Black/African American households outnumber the other races. This is a first that minority families received assistance with housing repairs and it is a split percentage for those that were able to purchase an affordable housing unit. Our stats prove that the programs are working and the funds are being used to help those in need.

CR-15 - Resources and Investments 91.520(a)

Identify the resources made available

Source of Funds	Source	Resources Made Available	Amount Expended During Program Year
CDBG	public - federal	973,451	676,858
HOME	public - federal	334,818	18,168

Table 3 - Resources Made Available

Narrative

Some of the projects set up for 2019 were not completed and other funds were not allocated in HOME for affordable housing units.

Identify the geographic distribution and location of investments

Target Area	Planned Percentage of Allocation	Actual Percentage of Allocation	Narrative Description
Muskegon	100	100	City Limits
Muskegon Heights			
Norton Shores			

Table 4 – Identify the geographic distribution and location of investments

Narrative

Our programs are designed to assist low-income residents and provide avenues for assistance to creating a variety of public facilities and services, youth recreation and economic development. As a participating jurisdiction, the city has committed funds for affordable housing units but very little movement has been achieved due to COVID-19. We are expecting to rebound within the coming months to meet our goals.

Leveraging

Explain how federal funds leveraged additional resources (private, state and local funds), including a description of how matching requirements were satisfied, as well as how any publicly owned land or property located within the jurisdiction that were used to address the needs identified in the plan.

We are pleased to mention that we are using our DTE Program to offset the costs of certain housing repairs- furnaces, water heaters and some electric and plumbing costs associated with these types of mechanical replacements and repairs. This allows us to use our CDBG funds on the most used repair/replacement- roofs. The ability to stretch our funds is accomplished through our local millage program that offers seniors an opportunity to garner a multitude of housing issues minor and major to allow for another avenue to cover high costs.

These have all been private properties in our community that could become blighted and abandoned without this assistance. The needs of our population given the current pandemic have been met through leveraging funds from other sources. It has been a great resource to assist more than would be possible with our current funding.

Fiscal Year Summary – HOME Match	
1. Excess match from prior Federal fiscal year	0
2. Match contributed during current Federal fiscal year	0
3. Total match available for current Federal fiscal year (Line 1 plus Line 2)	0
4. Match liability for current Federal fiscal year	0
5. Excess match carried over to next Federal fiscal year (Line 3 minus Line 4)	0

Table 5 – Fiscal Year Summary - HOME Match Report

Match Contribution for the Federal Fiscal Year								
Project No. or Other ID	Date of Contribution	Cash (non-Federal sources)	Foregone Taxes, Fees, Charges	Appraised Land/Real Property	Required Infrastructure	Site Preparation, Construction Materials, Donated labor	Bond Financing	Total Match

Table 6 – Match Contribution for the Federal Fiscal Year

HOME MBE/WBE report

Program Income – Enter the program amounts for the reporting period				
Balance on hand at begin-ning of reporting period \$	Amount received during reporting period \$	Total amount expended during reporting period \$	Amount expended for TBRA \$	Balance on hand at end of reporting period \$
496,271	343,421	461,471	0	378,221

Table 7 – Program Income

Minority Business Enterprises and Women Business Enterprises – Indicate the number and dollar value of contracts for HOME projects completed during the reporting period						
	Total	Minority Business Enterprises				White Non-Hispanic
		Alaskan Native or American Indian	Asian or Pacific Islander	Black Non-Hispanic	Hispanic	
Contracts						
Dollar Amount	261,360	0	0	0	0	261,360
Number	3	0	0	0	0	3
Sub-Contracts						
Number	3	0	0	0	0	3
Dollar Amount	78,425	0	0	0	0	78,425
	Total	Women Business Enterprises	Male			
Contracts						
Dollar Amount	261,360	0	261,360			
Number	3	0	3			
Sub-Contracts						
Number	3	0	3			
Dollar Amount	78,425	0	78,425			

Table 8 - Minority Business and Women Business Enterprises

Minority Owners of Rental Property – Indicate the number of HOME assisted rental property owners and the total amount of HOME funds in these rental properties assisted						
	Total	Minority Property Owners				White Non-Hispanic
		Alaskan Native or American Indian	Asian or Pacific Islander	Black Non-Hispanic	Hispanic	
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
Dollar Amount	0	0	0	0	0	0

Table 9 – Minority Owners of Rental Property

Relocation and Real Property Acquisition – Indicate the number of persons displaced, the cost of relocation payments, the number of parcels acquired, and the cost of acquisition						
Parcels Acquired		0		0		
Businesses Displaced		0		0		
Nonprofit Organizations Displaced		0		0		
Households Temporarily Relocated, not Displaced		0		0		
Households Displaced	Total	Minority Property Enterprises				White Non-Hispanic
		Alaskan Native or American Indian	Asian or Pacific Islander	Black Non-Hispanic	Hispanic	
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
Cost	0	0	0	0	0	0

Table 10 – Relocation and Real Property Acquisition

CR-20 - Affordable Housing 91.520(b)

Evaluation of the jurisdiction's progress in providing affordable housing, including the number and types of families served, the number of extremely low-income, low-income, moderate-income, and middle-income persons served.

	One-Year Goal	Actual
Number of Homeless households to be provided affordable housing units	0	0
Number of Non-Homeless households to be provided affordable housing units	8	2
Number of Special-Needs households to be provided affordable housing units	0	0
Total	8	2

Table 11 – Number of Households

	One-Year Goal	Actual
Number of households supported through Rental Assistance	4	0
Number of households supported through The Production of New Units	0	0
Number of households supported through Rehab of Existing Units	3	2
Number of households supported through Acquisition of Existing Units	1	0
Total	8	2

Table 12 – Number of Households Supported

Discuss the difference between goals and outcomes and problems encountered in meeting these goals.

The goals were minimal that will benefit through Affordable housing units. We were able to sell 2 properties through HOME programs.

Discuss how these outcomes will impact future annual action plans.

Through the use of CDBG funds and HOME funds the support to homeowners far outweighed the

Include the number of extremely low-income, low-income, and moderate-income persons served by each activity where information on income by family size is required to determine the eligibility of the activity.

Number of Households Served	CDBG Actual	HOME Actual
Extremely Low-income	18	0
Low-income	11	0
Moderate-income	9	2
Total	38	2

Table 13 – Number of Households Served

Narrative Information

We assisted 35 citizens with roofs, foundations, electric, plumbing, mechanical and facade replacements that were threatening the safety of their homes. The benefit to offering these programs helps to sustain households and support families that need specific, priority housing repairs/replacements.

CR-25 - Homeless and Other Special Needs 91.220(d, e); 91.320(d, e); 91.520(c)

Evaluate the jurisdiction's progress in meeting its specific objectives for reducing and ending homelessness through:

Reaching out to homeless persons (especially unsheltered persons) and assessing their individual needs

The city has made great progress as a board member of the Continuum of Care (CoC) to help reduce homelessness in our community. Regionally, the cities of Muskegon Heights and Norton Shores are represented as well, and our focus is to meet objectives set by the CoC board to reach this critical population.

Addressing the emergency shelter and transitional housing needs of homeless persons

The Continuum of Care board has the shelter agency present and informative of the needs of homeless persons. The Muskegon Area Mission supports females and males who are single or households that need shelter.

Helping low-income individuals and families avoid becoming homeless, especially extremely low-income individuals and families and those who are: likely to become homeless after being discharged from publicly funded institutions and systems of care (such as health care facilities, mental health facilities, foster care and other youth facilities, and corrections programs and institutions); and, receiving assistance from public or private agencies that address housing, health, social services, employment, education, or youth needs

Helping homeless persons (especially chronically homeless individuals and families, families with children, veterans and their families, and unaccompanied youth) make the transition to permanent housing and independent living, including shortening the period of time that individuals and families experience homelessness, facilitating access for homeless individuals and families to affordable housing units, and preventing individuals and families who were recently homeless from becoming homeless again

The CoC is an organization in pursuit of helping homeless persons find affordable housing in our community. The City has participated in a board capacity to structure and facilitate housing opportunities that prevent housed homeless families from experiencing another homeless scenario.

CR-30 - Public Housing 91.220(h); 91.320(j)

Actions taken to address the needs of public housing

Muskegon Housing Commission has representation of city staff on the Board to assist with the needs of those that in public housing. As a benefit to the Housing Commission, the city manager appoints board members as necessary. The needs of public housing and other programming is in consideration of the city of Muskegon's interest to address potential needs.

Actions taken to encourage public housing residents to become more involved in management and participate in homeownership

Public housing residents are known to be at a fixed-income status and because of this their likelihood to become a homeowner is rare. However, the opportunity to use homeownership has not been given in the past 10 years. Other strategies to encourage management were to include residents in decision making and changes to the public housing facility. A resident board is again, active and working with PHA staff to oversee the tenants issues and concerns.

Actions taken to provide assistance to troubled PHAs

Our local Muskegon Housing Commission (PHA) does not have a troubled status.

CR-35 - Other Actions 91.220(j)-(k); 91.320(i)-(j)

Actions taken to remove or ameliorate the negative effects of public policies that serve as barriers to affordable housing such as land use controls, tax policies affecting land, zoning ordinances, building codes, fees and charges, growth limitations, and policies affecting the return on residential investment. 91.220 (j); 91.320 (i)

Negative effects of policies that can be a barrier to housing is a planning department direction to address old zoning ordinances. The approach taken to complete an updated view of housing choice for our community and developers was achieved through rezoning of parcels in our eligible census tracts and our city is a redevelopment ready community.

Actions taken to address obstacles to meeting underserved needs. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

The underserved needs of our community required the location of resources. Our office has been able to remove the obstacle of financing programs through the access of other grants.

Actions taken to reduce lead-based paint hazards. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

We have a state funded program for Lead Based Paint hazards but mostly, every affordable housing unit produced is cleared of Lead-based paint hazards through abatement and remediate.

Our HOME funded units through Rental Rehab or Homeowner programs address lead as a required feature of renovations. Our programs include this action up front before rehabilitation can take place, and the properties are cleared to ensure safety of future residents.

Actions taken to reduce the number of poverty-level families. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

How can we use these funds to offer jobs and other developments that improve the income of our populations? We offer grants to local businesses to stay open but importantly more than that- to hire more workers. Another option is to allow business options to increase their labor force through tax abatement. If we can provide an avenue for new job development, the city is looking for ways to make it happen.

Actions taken to develop institutional structure. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

Institutional structure is developed through trial and success of building a strong community. Our neighborhoods are ways to improve strong living environments one household at time. Through our Priority Housing Repair program, we go to the homes of citizens requesting help to stabilize thier living environment. Doing this annually develops the institution of a good place to live and it structures our city to be appealing to others who choose to live here, play here and work here.

Actions taken to enhance coordination between public and private housing and social service agencies. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

Our social service agencies in our community have always been a partner to address the needs of our income challenged families. We work with the Department of Health and Human Services, Community Foundation and we receive referrals from many organizations that focus on housing, health and public need.

Identify actions taken to overcome the effects of any impediments identified in the jurisdictions analysis of impediments to fair housing choice. 91.520(a)

Our response to overcoming impediments identified of our jurisdiction occurred by contracting with the Fair Housing Center of West Michigan who review the HMDA reporting of the past years to show how our Banks are helping families. We saw the stats, we meet with local banks and lenders, and we shared how we can do better in a fair and impartial manner to overcome prejudice and discrimination. Using the FHCWM to help us survey our community residents, educate our local banks, realtors, rental owners, and ourselves to overcome hidden or visual disparities in our jurisdiction.

CR-40 - Monitoring 91.220 and 91.230

Describe the standards and procedures used to monitor activities carried out in furtherance of the plan and used to ensure long-term compliance with requirements of the programs involved, including minority business outreach and the comprehensive planning requirements

Homelessness is an ongoing issue that is being addressed by our Continuum of Care board for which the city of Muskegon has a seat. The partnership with other local agencies is crucial to set goals and objectives that monitor the activities of outreach to assist minorities, low-income and no income households. Working together to review standards set forth to improve the availability of housing and evaluate the progress.

Citizen Participation Plan 91.105(d); 91.115(d)

Describe the efforts to provide citizens with reasonable notice and an opportunity to comment on performance reports.

As we update the Citizen Participation Plan to include additional ways to notify the public through virtual arenas- Facebook, Website, Instagram, and postings. Reasonable notice gives a 10 day heads up for hearings and for 15, 20 and 30 day comment periods. It has been a big effort from our Information Technology department and the Clerk's office to assist us in this effort.

CR-45 - CDBG 91.520(c)

Specify the nature of, and reasons for, any changes in the jurisdiction's program objectives and indications of how the jurisdiction would change its programs as a result of its experiences.

No experiences occurred that would cause our city to alter objectives and goals or programs. Even with the pandemic during the last 3 months of the year, our staff was able to continue providing services to families in need.

Does this Jurisdiction have any open Brownfields Economic Development Initiative (BEDI) grants?

No

[BEDI grantees] Describe accomplishments and program outcomes during the last year.

CR-50 - HOME 91.520(d)

Include the results of on-site inspections of affordable rental housing assisted under the program to determine compliance with housing codes and other applicable regulations

Please list those projects that should have been inspected on-site this program year based upon the schedule in §92.504(d). Indicate which of these were inspected and a summary of issues that were detected during the inspection. For those that were not inspected, please indicate the reason and how you will remedy the situation.

Monitoring HOME assisted rentals happen every 3 years and the next cycle will be 2021. The monitoring process reviews occupants, rents, and code compliance of the property standards. During the monitoring process, you may know

Provide an assessment of the jurisdiction's affirmative marketing actions for HOME units. 92.351(b)

The city provides opportunity for

Refer to IDIS reports to describe the amount and use of program income for projects, including the number of projects and owner and tenant characteristics

HOME funds/Program Income provided in 2 different projects -Rental Rehab and Homebuyer Assistance

Describe other actions taken to foster and maintain affordable housing. 91.220(k) (STATES ONLY: Including the coordination of LIHTC with the development of affordable housing). 91.320(j)

Our designed programs utilizing HOME funds are to produce affordable housing units in our city.