

CR-05 - Goals and Outcomes

Progress the jurisdiction has made in carrying out its strategic plan and its action plan. 91.520(a)

This could be an overview that includes major initiatives and highlights that were proposed and executed throughout the program year.

Comparison of the proposed versus actual outcomes for each outcome measure submitted with the consolidated plan and explain, if applicable, why progress was not made toward meeting goals and objectives. 91.520(g)

Categories, priority levels, funding sources and amounts, outcomes/objectives, goal outcome indicators, units of measure, targets, actual outcomes/outputs, and percentage completed for each of the grantee's program year goals.

Goal	Category	Source / Amount	Indicator	Unit of Measure	Expected – Strategic Plan	Actual – Strategic Plan	Percent Complete	Expected – Program Year	Actual – Program Year	Percent Complete
Acquisition Development Resale	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Homeowner Housing Added	Household Housing Unit	10	0	0.00%			
Code Enforcement - Inspections	Non-Housing Community Development Housing Rehab	CDBG: \$	Housing Code Enforcement/Foreclosed Property Care	Household Housing Unit	275	0	0.00%	150	0	0.00%
Code Enforcement - Neighborhood Clean-Up	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	10	0	0.00%			

Code Enforcement - Smoke and CO Detectors	Code Enforcement, Neighborhood Safety, Public Service	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	250	0	0.00%			
Demolition	Non-Housing Community Development Blight Fight	CDBG: \$	Buildings Demolished	Buildings	35	0	0.00%	5	0	0.00%
Demolition	Non-Housing Community Development Blight Fight	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	0	0		15	0	0.00%
Exterior Paint/Siding Housing	Neighborhood Stabilization, Enhancement, Code Enforcement, Preserving of Existing Housing Stock	CDBG: \$	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities for Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Households Assisted	55	0	0.00%			
Exterior Paint/Siding Housing	Neighborhood Stabilization, Enhancement, Code Enforcement, Preserving of Existing Housing Stock	CDBG: \$	Homeowner Housing Rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	0	0		7	0	0.00%

Exterior Paint/Siding Housing	Neighborhood Stabilization, Enhancement, Code Enforcement, Preserving of Existing Housing Stock	CDBG: \$	Jobs created/retained	Jobs	5	0	0.00%			
Fair Housing	Non-Housing Community Development Fair Housing Activities	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	25	0	0.00%			
Home Repairs	Home Repairs	CDBG: \$	Homeowner Housing Rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	500	0	0.00%	25	0	0.00%
Homebuyer Assistance/Education	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Homeowner Housing Added	Household Housing Unit	15	0	0.00%			
Housing	Affordable Housing	HOME: \$	Homeowner Housing Added	Household Housing Unit	5	0	0.00%	3	0	0.00%
Housing	Affordable Housing	HOME: \$	Jobs created/retained	Jobs	5	0	0.00%			
Improved Neighborhoods	Non-Housing Community Development Economic Development	CDBG: \$	Jobs created/retained	Jobs	5	0	0.00%			

Improved Neighborhoods	Non-Housing Community Development Economic Development	CDBG: \$	Businesses assisted	Businesses Assisted	0	0		10	0	0.00%
Improved Neighborhoods	Non-Housing Community Development Economic Development	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	3	0	0.00%	1	0	0.00%
Legal Services	Education, Outreach, Public Service	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	10	0	0.00%			
Match Funding	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	10	0	0.00%			
Neighborhood Policing	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	25	0	0.00%			
Owner Occupied Rehabilitation	Home Repairs	CDBG: \$	Homeowner Housing Rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	350	0	0.00%			
Public Facilities Improvement	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	3	0	0.00%	500	0	0.00%
Public Service Opportunities	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	50	0	0.00%			

Public Service Opportunities	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Homeowner Housing Rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	10	0	0.00%			
Rental Rehabilitation Program	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$	Rental units rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	15	0	0.00%			
Senior Assistance	Non-Homeless Special Needs	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	375	0	0.00%			
Streets	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	500	0	0.00%			
Streets	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	0	0		1	0	0.00%
Youth Opportunities	Non-Housing Community Development Youth Experiences	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	2500	0	0.00%	475	0	0.00%
Youth Opportunities	Non-Housing Community Development Youth Experiences	CDBG: \$	Jobs created/retained	Jobs	4	0	0.00%	25	0	0.00%

Table 1 - Accomplishments – Program Year & Strategic Plan to Date

Assess how the jurisdiction's use of funds, particularly CDBG, addresses the priorities and specific objectives identified in the plan, giving special attention to the highest priority activities identified.

Our highest priority of activities is given to low income households. We have several programs designed to assist individuals and families who require assistance with home repairs. The program called Priority Home Repair

CR-10 - Racial and Ethnic composition of families assisted

Describe the families assisted (including the racial and ethnic status of families assisted).

91.520(a)

	CDBG	HOME
White	20	42
Black or African American	14	27
Asian	1	0
American Indian or American Native	1	0
Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander	0	0
Total	36	69
Hispanic	3	0
Not Hispanic	36	69

Table 2 – Table of assistance to racial and ethnic populations by source of funds

Narrative

The department of Community and Neighborhood Services was able to provide 39 citizens with multiple housing repairs totaling \$ 242,653.00. An assortment of home repairs including roofs, furnaces, sewer lines, chimney repair, porch replacements, and water heaters. 21 Head of Households were over 60 years of age, most were homes built before 1978 and of those that received a repair, a surprising number of 29 households received a roof!

Sustaining households through this program makes it possible for families to continue to occupy their homes. Major repairs are necessary to avoid deterioration of living structures, and ultimate blight in neighborhoods.

CR-15 - Resources and Investments 91.520(a)

Identify the resources made available

Source of Funds	Source	Resources Made Available	Amount Expended During Program Year
CDBG	public - federal	937,658	690,046
HOME	public - federal	327,681	220,953

Table 3 - Resources Made Available

Narrative

Resources that we use are strictly federal- HOME Investment dollars or Program Income from the sales of Affordable housing purchases.

Identify the geographic distribution and location of investments

Target Area	Planned Percentage of Allocation	Actual Percentage of Allocation	Narrative Description
Muskegon	100		
Muskegon Heights			
Norton Shores			

Table 4 – Identify the geographic distribution and location of investments

Narrative

The city limits of Muskegon is the geographic area of HOME Investment. We have worked in all Neighborhoods except Glenside and East Muskegon. It is hopeful that we can utilize the funds in 2019 to provide Affordable Housing units within these neighborhoods.

Leveraging

Explain how federal funds leveraged additional resources (private, state and local funds), including a description of how matching requirements were satisfied, as well as how any publicly owned land or property located within the jurisdiction that were used to address the needs identified in the plan.

No HOME Match is required for the City of Muskegon.

Fiscal Year Summary – HOME Match	
1. Excess match from prior Federal fiscal year	0
2. Match contributed during current Federal fiscal year	0
3. Total match available for current Federal fiscal year (Line 1 plus Line 2)	0
4. Match liability for current Federal fiscal year	0
5. Excess match carried over to next Federal fiscal year (Line 3 minus Line 4)	0

Table 5 – Fiscal Year Summary - HOME Match Report

Match Contribution for the Federal Fiscal Year								
Project No. or Other ID	Date of Contribution	Cash (non-Federal sources)	Foregone Taxes, Fees, Charges	Appraised Land/Real Property	Required Infrastructure	Site Preparation, Construction Materials, Donated labor	Bond Financing	Total Match

Table 6 – Match Contribution for the Federal Fiscal Year

HOME MBE/WBE report

Program Income – Enter the program amounts for the reporting period				
Balance on hand at begin-ning of reporting period \$	Amount received during reporting period \$	Total amount expended during reporting period \$	Amount expended for TBRA \$	Balance on hand at end of reporting period \$
389,543	327,681	220,953	0	496,271

Table 7 – Program Income

Minority Business Enterprises and Women Business Enterprises – Indicate the number and dollar value of contracts for HOME projects completed during the reporting period						
	Total	Minority Business Enterprises				White Non-Hispanic
		Alaskan Native or American Indian	Asian or Pacific Islander	Black Non-Hispanic	Hispanic	
Contracts						
Dollar Amount	164,970	0	0	73,250	0	91,720
Number	2	0	0	1	0	1
Sub-Contracts						
Number	4	0	0	1	0	3
Dollar Amount	11,086	0	0	5,730	0	5,356
	Total	Women Business Enterprises	Male			
Contracts						
Dollar Amount	164,970	0	164,970			
Number	2	0	2			
Sub-Contracts						
Number	4	2	2			
Dollar Amount	11,086	2,675	8,411			

Table 8 - Minority Business and Women Business Enterprises

Minority Owners of Rental Property – Indicate the number of HOME assisted rental property owners and the total amount of HOME funds in these rental properties assisted						
	Total	Minority Property Owners				White Non-Hispanic
		Alaskan Native or American Indian	Asian or Pacific Islander	Black Non-Hispanic	Hispanic	
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
Dollar Amount	0	0	0	0	0	0

Table 9 – Minority Owners of Rental Property

Relocation and Real Property Acquisition – Indicate the number of persons displaced, the cost of relocation payments, the number of parcels acquired, and the cost of acquisition						
Parcels Acquired		1	36,390			
Businesses Displaced		0	0			
Nonprofit Organizations Displaced		0	0			
Households Temporarily Relocated, not Displaced		0	0			
Households Displaced	Total	Minority Property Enterprises				White Non-Hispanic
		Alaskan Native or American Indian	Asian or Pacific Islander	Black Non-Hispanic	Hispanic	
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
Cost	0	0	0	0	0	0

Table 10 – Relocation and Real Property Acquisition

CR-20 - Affordable Housing 91.520(b)

Evaluation of the jurisdiction's progress in providing affordable housing, including the number and types of families served, the number of extremely low-income, low-income, moderate-income, and middle-income persons served.

	One-Year Goal	Actual
Number of Homeless households to be provided affordable housing units	0	0
Number of Non-Homeless households to be provided affordable housing units	9	3
Number of Special-Needs households to be provided affordable housing units	0	0
Total	9	3

Table 11 – Number of Households

	One-Year Goal	Actual
Number of households supported through Rental Assistance	5	0
Number of households supported through The Production of New Units	0	0
Number of households supported through Rehab of Existing Units	3	2
Number of households supported through Acquisition of Existing Units	1	1
Total	9	3

Table 12 – Number of Households Supported

Discuss the difference between goals and outcomes and problems encountered in meeting these goals.

The goals were set pretty high for 2018 in a couple of categories, however homelessness measurements are not accounted for in this CAPER.

Discuss how these outcomes will impact future annual action plans.

It is important to review the actuals versus the data collected to adjust our numbers for future Action Plans. We have 1 Plan left in accordance with this 5 year Regional Consolidated Plan.

Muskegon county/region has changed! Development is everywhere, however the accessibility of low income housing and other opportunities for households targeted for CBDG assistance needs to be reflect the current atmosphere. It may be that we have to address new concerns of the housing climate change.

Include the number of extremely low-income, low-income, and moderate-income persons served by each activity where information on income by family size is required to determine the eligibility of the activity.

Number of Households Served	CDBG Actual	HOME Actual
Extremely Low-income	11	0
Low-income	17	1
Moderate-income	11	1
Total	39	2

Table 13 – Number of Households Served

Narrative Information

2018 provided 39 income eligible households an opportunity to receive an improvement to thier housing with our Priority Housing Progam. This program assists families wtih home repairs that threaten health, or safety. There are roofs, foundations, furnaces and plumbing or sewer concerns that are replaced or updated due to the current condition. Also, we were able to complete 2 signed contracts for Home Rehabilitation of Affordable Housing and 2 buyers took advantge of our Homebuyers Program using HOME Funds.

CR-25 - Homeless and Other Special Needs 91.220(d, e); 91.320(d, e); 91.520(c)

Evaluate the jurisdiction's progress in meeting its specific objectives for reducing and ending homelessness through:

Reaching out to homeless persons (especially unsheltered persons) and assessing their individual needs

Our commitment to the Homeless population has not decreased. The objective is to continue participation and partnerships with our local agencies working with ESG funds to avoid homelessness.

We have met some targets but always with some losses- we continue to combat issues that bring resistance to our goals. We meet quarterly, and we review the progress annually to make any changes needed to improve and meet the objectives of reducing and one day ending homelessness.

Addressing the emergency shelter and transitional housing needs of homeless persons

We cannot assist financially but our CoC is a force to address the emergency shelters in our area. Transitional housing is needed but our role is minimal.

Helping low-income individuals and families avoid becoming homeless, especially extremely low-income individuals and families and those who are: likely to become homeless after being discharged from publicly funded institutions and systems of care (such as health care facilities, mental health facilities, foster care and other youth facilities, and corrections programs and institutions); and, receiving assistance from public or private agencies that address housing, health, social services, employment, education, or youth needs

We partner with several organizations- Men's and Women's Mission, Dept. Health and Human Services and Health West who are organized to prevent low-income families from becoming homeless. We have the resources and we look for ways to make this happen.

Helping homeless persons (especially chronically homeless individuals and families, families with children, veterans and their families, and unaccompanied youth) make the transition to permanent housing and independent living, including shortening the period of time that individuals and families experience homelessness, facilitating access for homeless individuals and families to affordable housing units, and preventing individuals and families who were recently homeless from becoming homeless again

Our local CoC is our advocate for reaching families. We serve on the board of the CoC and we help with policy and other regulatory issues to stop the repeat of homelessness in families.

CR-30 - Public Housing 91.220(h); 91.320(j)

Actions taken to address the needs of public housing

The needs of the individuals and households of public housing are expressed through the eyes of the Muskegon Housing Commission Director, Angie Mayeaux. The Director reports monthly to our agency and their PHA Capital funding addresses their housing issues, maintains scattered sites owned by the commission, and offers multiple programs/recreation in-house.

Local agencies are scheduled monthly to come into the Public Housing site to offer special programs in addition to this, a monthly calendar is posted on all floors of the building for the 166 potential occupants.

Actions taken to encourage public housing residents to become more involved in management and participate in homeownership

Our actions have been minimal. At least 2 grantee staff persons sit on the Muskegon Housing Commission board, Ken Grant -Assistant Finance Director and Oneata Bailey, Community and Neighborhood Services Director. The struggle to move these residents into a homeownership direction is limited because most of these occupants (70%) are on fixed incomes or social security payments *only*. Unfortunately, our ability to assist public housing residents with affordable

Actions taken to provide assistance to troubled PHAs

Our PHA (Public Housing Authority) in Muskegon is the Muskegon Housing Commission(MHC). MHC is not designated as a troubled PHA. It may have received some less-than-positive reports related to their annual inspection but all have been corrected and cleared.

CR-35 - Other Actions 91.220(j)-(k); 91.320(i)-(j)

Actions taken to remove or ameliorate the negative effects of public policies that serve as barriers to affordable housing such as land use controls, tax policies affecting land, zoning ordinances, building codes, fees and charges, growth limitations, and policies affecting the return on residential investment. 91.220 (j); 91.320 (i)

Our planning department is well aware of our work with fair housing initiatives, and affordable housing activities. We work together to remove any variance of poor policies that make barriers for low income households, or minority families. It works to be abreast of Economic Development activities that could cause a hardship or blockage of affordable housing. WE meet every other month to discuss projects and potential investments. This helps to keep this process transparent.

Actions taken to address obstacles to meeting underserved needs. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

We used our water billing service to reach the masses last fall of 2018. The intent was to share our programs that assist directly with the citizens in our community that need housing repair assistance.

We know that those who need help in our area will 1st request our help with where they live. This is how we can reach the underserved and get this information into their hands, and hopefully through word of mouth. We can spread the resources to those who really don't know where to go or that we have opportunities to do better.

Actions taken to reduce lead-based paint hazards. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

We take Lead Based Paint seriously! We have a CHIP program that is funded through the State of Michigan, we require Lead Inspections of all of our Rental Rehabilitation Program participants, and we address all lead hazards in our Homebuyer Program. This is an important action that mandates abatement, and sometimes interim controls measures to keep our affordable housing free of Lead and to help landlords and citizens who have suffered from the consequences of Lead Based Paint.

Actions taken to reduce the number of poverty-level families. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

Our economic development team is working with potential investors to bring jobs to our area. This past year we have made great strides to increase the number of jobs in our region!

Actions taken to develop institutional structure. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

We have a structure that cross-trains staff to make sure that our Institutional Structure is in place for years to come. It is vital to continue our fast-paced work of helping families who need assistance through our HUD funds. We have informed our Administration and our Commissioners but mainly, our office has a strong and vital staff that is educating our citizenry of the great services available to

them. We attend city-wide events, we distribute information on our website, and we go on the radio.

Actions taken to enhance coordination between public and private housing and social service agencies. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

We have local partnerships with several agencies- Call 211, Department of Health and Human Services, CoC of Muskegon, Community enCompass (HARA), Every Women's Place, you name it and we have been there to assist. In addition, our regional service area partnership with Muskegon Heights and Norton Shores allows us to coordinate services, enhance visibility and combine Public Housing agencies with local social service agencies. We attend local meetings, sit on boards, and participate in annual events.

Identify actions taken to overcome the effects of any impediments identified in the jurisdictions analysis of impediments to fair housing choice. 91.520(a)

The Fair Housing Agency of West Michigan has been a partner to our regional grantees. As a result of the last AI study of 2016, regionally, we have been instructed to investigate the banking practices in Muskegon County. Muskegon Heights, Norton Shores and Muskegon embarked on including this into our last agreement with our closest FH agency...their report was delivered in July 2019. It is being reviewed and the information will be shared with the public once it is approved by all of the parties involved.

This report will guide us into our next Action Plan year and I am sure that it will be included in our programming as we try to overcome these impediments to housing choice. We all agree that the FH agency is valuable to us and our communities. Thus, the grantees are unanimous in signing a 3 year agreement with the FH agency for testing, surveys, education, and reporting of their influence to overcome these types of prejudices.

CR-40 - Monitoring 91.220 and 91.230

Describe the standards and procedures used to monitor activities carried out in furtherance of the plan and used to ensure long-term compliance with requirements of the programs involved, including minority business outreach and the comprehensive planning requirements

Ending homelessness in our county is supported by our participation with the Continuum of Care network of partners. The city of Muskegon is an active participant serving on the Executive Board and review committees. Our support has not been financial but our commitment to being a part of the solution locally is the reason for our participation. Currently, our monitoring process is quarterly and being used to end homelessness through minority businesses or planning requirements.

Hopefully at some point in the future, the city of Muskegon could have a larger impact to increase the progress in meeting specific objectives set by our CoC to reduce and end homelessness by giving money to make our goals reachable. Our jurisdiction is talking about other types of programs TBRA that could benefit this population and directly assist the homeless populations in need of security deposits and 1st month's rent.

Citizen Participation Plan 91.105(d); 91.115(d)

Describe the efforts to provide citizens with reasonable notice and an opportunity to comment on performance reports.

We place a public notice in our News Paper and on our Website of our CAPER availability at the end of August every year stating where a copy can be accessed. The comment period is noted on the Public Notice (15 or 20 days) and we appear before our Commissioners at a regularly scheduled meeting to accept comments and questions (provided in the Public Notice).

CR-45 - CDBG 91.520(c)

Specify the nature of, and reasons for, any changes in the jurisdiction's program objectives and indications of how the jurisdiction would change its programs as a result of its experiences.

Our objectives have shifted toward youth programs and opportunities to impact young lives, support education and invest in our community. Looking more into Economic Development of

Does this Jurisdiction have any open Brownfields Economic Development Initiative (BEDI) grants?

No

[BEDI grantees] Describe accomplishments and program outcomes during the last year.

CR-50 - HOME 91.520(d)

Include the results of on-site inspections of affordable rental housing assisted under the program to determine compliance with housing codes and other applicable regulations

Please list those projects that should have been inspected on-site this program year based upon the schedule in §92.504(d). Indicate which of these were inspected and a summary of issues that were detected during the inspection. For those that were not inspected, please indicate the reason and how you will remedy the situation.

The Affordable housing inspection list is updated annually. This year, July 1st, 2018 - June of 2019, there were no new projects added to our Rental Rehabilitation list. Rental Rehab projects are inspected every 3 years and 2017 was the last inspection of rental properties. Since 2017, no new Rental Rehab projects were completed and thus no 1 year evaluation was performed after 12 months from completion.

Provide an assessment of the jurisdiction's affirmative marketing actions for HOME units. 92.351(b)

Our affirmative marketing plan will be reviewed in the coming months to secure that minority contractor, investors, businesses, and low-income opportunities are being given as much opportunity as possible.

We have a person working at our city who helps to investigate complaints, concerns and businesses investing in our community. This happens annually but our plan hasn't changed in a few years.

Refer to IDIS reports to describe the amount and use of program income for projects, including the number of projects and owner and tenant characteristics

We use our Program Income for Homebuyer Assistance Grants- DPA for buyers who select homes in our city limits! It has been a fantastic way to encourage buying in our city and we have it available to low-income households only. We use 1/3 of our Program Income in this way with produces homeowners who are income eligible to live in this city. We can show how great a program it is and we plan a celebration of 5 years of success in November of 2019.

Describe other actions taken to foster and maintain affordable housing. 91.220(k) (STATES ONLY: Including the coordination of LIHTC with the development of affordable housing). 91.320(j)

We try to rehab or build 2 homes a year with our HOME funds. Our contribution to Landlords at a 50/50 ratio helps to create affordable units, and our CHDO investments secure a stream of projects year after year.

