

CITY OF MUSKEGON  
**HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION**  
REGULAR MEETING  
MINUTES

**February 7, 2012**

Chairperson J. Hilt called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m. and roll was taken.

MEMBERS PRESENT: J. Hilt, L. Spataro, S. Radtke, L. Wood, D. Mayville, K. Panozzo

MEMBERS ABSENT: S. Kroes, excused

STAFF PRESENT: C. Brubaker-Clarke, D. Renkenberger

OTHERS PRESENT: J. Schultz, Schultz Landscaping; D. Cook, Schultz Landscaping; B. Young, City Parks Maintenance Supervisor; B. Chapla, Community Foundation; K. Zimmerman, Community EnCompass; D. Erickson, 1347 4<sup>th</sup> St; S. Ferguson, City CNS Department

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion to approve the regular meeting minutes of January 10, 2012 was made by L. Spataro, supported by J. Hilt and unanimously approved.

NEW BUSINESS

Case 2012-01 – Hackley Park. Applicant: Community Foundation for Muskegon County. District: National Register. Current Function: Park. The Community Foundation for Muskegon County has received a large donation from Norma Horan that she would like to be used for landscaping enhancements and maintenance at Hackley Park. This case was tabled from last month's meeting to allow the applicant to draw up further details for the landscaping plan.

B. Chapla discussed updates to the landscaping plan. D. Cook stated that he had read through the Master Plan for the park again, and discussed the recommendations listed in the plan. He stated that they would need to prune several of the trees in order to provide enough sun for the grass and flowers. Flower beds were discussed, as well as ways to help keep them from being trampled. L. Spataro suggested raising the beds a few inches. L. Spataro suggested separating the items being discussed into three separate issues for voting: 1) tree pruning, 2) tree removal, and 3) planting/landscaping. B. Young stated that she had obtained a report from an arborist regarding some of the park trees, including the one that was suggested for removal at the last meeting. The arborist stated that the tree was healthy, and estimated it to be about 200 years old, pre-dating the park. B. Young stated that the City's Forestry Department would do the tree trimming.

A motion to approve the landscaping as proposed was made by L. Wood and supported by K. Panozzo. L. Spataro requested more clarification on what was approved. An amended motion was made and seconded, to approve the flower beds and tree pruning as proposed. An additional motion to approve the removal of the large oak tree, was made by L. Spataro and supported by S. Radtke and failed, with all members voting nay. The large oak tree will not be removed. A motion to approve the transplant of two of the three improperly planted trees by the memorial located at the

southwest corner of the park was made by L. Spataro, supported by L. Wood and unanimously approved. It was decided that Planning staff would contact Mrs. Stewart regarding the relocation of the trees.

Schultz Landscaping personnel, board members, and staff also discussed placing a memorial to the Horan's in Hackley Park. The tentative plan was to use a large boulder, which Schultz Landscaping had. C. Brubaker-Clarke stated that staff would work with the landscapers to make sure the memorial was appropriate to the park and pleasing to the donor.

Case 2012-02 – 1347 Fourth Street. Applicant: David Erickson. District: Houston. Current Function: Residential. C. Brubaker-Clarke presented the staff report. The applicant is seeking approval to replace the wood windows with vinyl windows. A case involving re-siding this house with vinyl siding was presented and approved at a previous HDC meeting. At that time, the HDC had requested that the applicant get an estimate for repairing the wooden windows. The applicant has compared the prices of buying new vinyl windows versus refurbishing the old wood windows, and found that fixing the wood windows was cost prohibitive.

K. Zimmerman worked for Community EnCompass, which was assisting with funds for rehabbing this house. She stated that Community EnCompass had decided not to do the windows after finding out the cost, but that the homeowner would still like to install vinyl windows. The estimate for repairing the wood windows was over \$24,000, which was nearly the entire amount of funds available for all rehab work to be done (\$25,000). D. Erickson was the homeowner. He stated that his income had been cut due to the economy and he could not afford to maintain the house as it was, nor was he able to sell it. The condition of the windows made the house very expensive to heat. He brought in a sample vinyl window and stated that he had gotten a good price on them, and wanted to replace the old wood windows for better heating efficiency. L. Spataro stated that a general HDC requirement when replacing windows was that all window openings and configurations are retained. K. Zimmerman stated that they planned to comply with that, as they wanted to retain as much of the historical look of the house as possible.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to replace the wood windows with vinyl windows as proposed, as long as all window openings and configurations are retained, all zoning requirements are met, and any necessary permits are obtained, was made by L. Spataro, supported by K. Panozzo and approved, with S. Radtke voting nay.

Case 2012-03 – 25 Merrill Avenue. Applicant: City of Muskegon Community & Neighborhood Services Department. District: McLaughlin. Current Function: Residential. C. Brubaker-Clarke presented the staff report. The applicant is seeking approval to replace the current wood siding with vinyl siding with funds acquired through the City of Muskegon's Community and Neighborhood Services Vinyl Siding Program.

S. Ferguson of the City's Community and Neighborhood Services Department described the work to be done and provided a color sample for the new siding. It was similar to the color currently on the house. Board members discussed the style of the house, and concurred that the house had been previously modified from its original condition.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to replace the wood siding with vinyl siding as long as all architectural features are retained, the work meets all zoning requirements, and the necessary permits are obtained, was made by L. Spataro, supported by K. Panozzo and unanimously approved.

OLD BUSINESS

None

OTHER

None

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:56 p.m.